



TOWN OF WINCHESTER
MIDDLESEX COUNTY, MASSACHUSETTS
HISTORICAL COMMISSION
TOWN HALL
WINCHESTER, MASSACHUSETTS 01890

Meeting Minutes

Date/Room: April 8, 2019

Members Present: Jack LeMenager (Chair), Jon Carlisle, John Clemson, and Emily Dowling

Absent: Jenny Adams, Janet Boswell, Bruce Hickey

Also Present: Phyllis Etsell – Representative for Murray Construction
Paul Devaney – 41 Allen Rd Sandeep Desai – 30 Middlesex St
Paul Petrillo – 52 Allen Rd Mathila Desai – 30 Middlesex St
Paula Spencer – 11 Sherwood Rd Michael Arwe – 53 Allen Road
Gian and Michele Wiegner – 43 Ledyard Rd

A quorum being in attendance, the meeting was called to order at 7:30 pm.

Meeting Minutes

Motion That the Historical Commission approve the minutes of the February 11, 2019 as presented. The motion was made by Emily Dowling and seconded. The motion was approved unanimously.

3 in Favor 0 Opposed 1 Abstain Carlisle Absent: Adams, Boswell, Hickey VOTED

Other Matters:

Chair LeMenager stated that he has spoken with Brian Szekely regarding a letter to area realtors. He referenced the letter written by a realtor regarding 11 Ravine Rd. The proposed letter would inform realtors how the demolition delay bylaw works and how to determine whether a particular property is eligible for review, and the process that would have to be followed.

Demolition Delay Hearing -36-38 Middlesex St

Hearing opened at 7:35pm

John Clemson presented the Form B (prepared by Claire Dempsey). The duplex house was built in 1896-1898. There are a few minor alterations – aluminum siding (clapboards underneath?), porches added to the rear, bulkhead addition, basement concrete floor added, etc. This building is one of a group of buildings lining the west side of Middlesex Street, which presents a distinguished streetscape of small to moderate sized homes. Well preserved area with an iconic landscape representing the social history of the town. This area has been recommended for a National Register Listing as part of a group of houses in an Historical District.

Phyllis Etsell was present on behalf of Mr. Murray, applicant. Ms. Etsell stated that Mr. Murray feels that a renovation is not financially feasible, due to the condition of the property. Porch on the back is a covered porch front porch detaching from the house. Interior furnishings are 1950's in both the bath and kitchen areas, basement has sump pumps for water issues, 2 boilers – 1 not working, fieldstone foundation in need of repair. House is currently 2,332 sq ft. She explained that this size does not meet most real estate buyers' needs for this Town.

Chair LeMenager asked if any proposed plans had been developed yet. Ms. Etsell stated nothing has been planned to date but due to the shallow lot size it is planned to rebuild a duplex with a similar style. Lot size is 7,059 sq ft, if new building is under 4,600 a special permit will not be needed. Chair LeMenager expressed concern if the replacement would overpower all the adjacent houses on the street. There will probably be 1 attached garage per unit in the new build.

Emily Dowling asked if Mr. Murray priced out what would the cost would be for a renovation and addition. Water, porches, and windows can be fixed. Ms Etsell did not know the cost of renovating the home.

7:53 open public comment

Neighbors right next door – Mr. and Mrs. Dasai – expressed concern about their ranch house would be overpowered by a large home being built next door.

7:56 close public comment

John Clemson – significant home within the group of relative buildings that line the west side of the street. Very important to keep group intact. The whole area is National Register District eligible.

Jon Carlisle – all the buildings are consistent on that side of the road. Understand that a building in disrepair takes time and money to bring back to life. If demo does happen wants a close replica to original.

Emily Dowling – needed repairs are doable and wants to save the house.

Jack LeMenager – mindful of the 12-month delay and aware that Mr. Murray has waited the full 12 months on other projects in the past. If the delay is imposed wants Mr. Murray to negotiate with the HC to ensure the neighborhood maintains a cohesive look.

Motion: That the Historical Commission finds the home located at 36-38 Middlesex Street a historically significant building. The motion was made by John Clemson and seconded.

4 in favor 0 opposed 3 absent: Adams, Boswell, Hickey VOTED

Motion: That the Historical Commission will impose a twelve-month delay on the issuance of the demolition permit on the property at 36-38 Middlesex Street. The motion was made by Emily Dowling and seconded.

4 in favor 0 opposed 3 absent: Adams, Boswell, Hickey VOTED

Chair LeMenager again expressed the ability to negotiate and reduce the 12-month delay. He encouraged Mr. Murray through his representative to come back to the HC with a rough proposal. Maintaining the streetscape is the top concern with a new building proposed

8:02 pm hearing closed

Demolition Delay Hearing – 49 Allen Road

8:03pm hearing opened.

John Clemson presented the Form B (prepared by Claire Dempsey). The house was built in 1935 in the popular modern cape style. Home retains cohesive massing, gable roof, dormers, some replacement windows and sashes. Phyllis Etsell was present on behalf of Mr. Murray, the applicant. Ms. Etsell stated the house is not in good condition. Lots of water damage due to leaking roof – windows, walls, and ceilings all have staining. Second floor rooms have sloped floors, Kitchen has no heat source, and visible mold inside of the cabinets. Basement has two sump pumps and a fieldstone foundation in disrepair. Does not feel it is not worthy of expansion. The property cannot be rented under the current conditions. The lot is 10,000 sq ft and the current home is 1,400 sq ft. Ms. Etsell said that Mr. Murray wants to do a single family, two-story home. Does not want to apply for a special permit.

8:17 public comment opened

Neighbors expressed concern over the possible size of the replacement home stating that this builder, Mr. Murray, built a large house at the other end of Allen St that is out of scale with the neighborhood. Neighbors would like a similar house in size and style to the existing home and that will not change the look of the neighborhood. Ms. Etsell stated that she would relay all the information from these hearings to Mr. Murray and will also relay all of the neighbors' concerns regarding the size and characteristics of the replacement house.

8:24 public comment closed

John Clemson supports the preservation of the characteristic of the neighborhood. Encourages an addition to the back of the building – maintenance issues can be dealt with and kitchens always need updating.

Jack LeMenager– Concerned Mr. Murray will wait out the 12-month period and build without any input from the HC or neighbors. Wants to negotiate. Prefer massing of a new building in the rear of the lot with a subtle frontage. Preserve character of the neighborhood.

Emily Dowling – Wishes to preserve the look of the neighborhood.

Jon Carlisle – Beautiful home, understands that lack of upkeep can pose a large problem logistically and financially.

Motion: That the Historical Commission finds the home located at 49 Allen Road historically significant building. The motion was made by John Clemson and seconded.

4 in favor 0 opposed 3 absent: Adams, Boswell, Hickey VOTED

Motion: That the Historical Commission will impose a twelve-month delay on the issuance of the demolition permit on the property at 49 Allen Road. The motion was made by John Clemson and seconded.

4 in favor 0 opposed 3 absent: Adams, Boswell, Hickey VOTED

Hearing closed 8:35pm

Chair LeMenager again expressed the Commission’s desire to negotiate in exchange for reducing the 12-month delay. He encouraged Mr. Murray to come back to the HC with a rough proposal. Maintaining the streetscape is the top concern with a new building proposed

ZBA Petitions

- 1 Winter Street – Special Permit for an addition to close to the front property line.

Discussion occurred regarding the addition affecting the front facade of the property. The HC suggests that the addition be set back from the front façade, which appears possible without loss of the proposed additional square footage.

Motion: The Historical Commission recommended unfavorable action due to the project’s adverse effect on the historical or cultural resource. The proposed addition should be subordinate to the main mass of the current house.

Voted 4 to 0 3 Absent: Adams, Boswell, Hickey (ref 9.4.2.4)

- 6 Glen Road - Special Permit and Site Plan review- Additions do not change the front façade.

Motion: The Historical Commission finds no adverse effect on a historical or cultural resource.

Voted 4 to 0 3 Absent: Adams, Boswell, Hickey (ref 9.4.2.4)

Next Meeting

The next meeting will be held on Monday, April 29, 2019 at the Winchester High School. Heather von Mering will present the Planning Board’s Town Meeting Warrant regarding the Central Business District Review bylaws.

It was moved and seconded to adjourn at 8:50 pm. VOTED

Respectfully submitted,
Lynn Stevens, Recording Secretary

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "JL", with a long, sweeping horizontal stroke extending to the right.

Jack LeMenager, Chair

6/4/19

Date