



**TOWN OF WINCHESTER**  
MIDDLESSEX COUNTY, MASSACHUSETTS  
HISTORICAL COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES  
WINCHESTER TOWN HALL / WINCHESTER, MASSACHUSETTS, 01890

**Date/ Room:** August 5, 2019  
Mystic Valley Room, Winchester Town Hall, Lower Level

**Members Present:** John Clemson  
Jennifer Adams  
Jack LeMenager, Chairman  
Jon Carlisle

**Members Absent:** Bruce Hickey, Vice Chair  
Janet Boswell  
Emily Dowling

**Also Present:** Brian Szekely, Town Planner  
Mahala Lettvin, Recording Secretary  
Dan Lanz, 76 Hemmingway St.  
Diab Jerius, 26 Canal St./ Winchester Planning Board Member  
Jennifer & Clint Sard, 46 Allen Rd.  
Chris Downey, 1 Winter St.

---

With a quorum in attendance, Jack LeMenager calls the Winchester Historical Commission meeting to order at 7:31 pm.

**Demolition Permit Follow-Up:**

- 4 Ardley Place

Owner Dan Lanz summarized his plans for a colonial style house, recapping his prior presentation to the Historical Commission. Mr. Lanz explained the two sketches provided, noting options for the placement of the garage. In the top sketch, he noted that the turning radius may cause issues, and in the bottom sketch, the garage is placed too far back in the lot. Mr. Lanz explained the garage would be obscured by the house and therefore not visible while traveling down the street. He noted that the Commission's concerns that the garage was set too far forward are addressed in the current sketches, pointing to the garage placement 5 feet back from the front plane of the house.

Both LeMenager and Carlisle like the wrap-around porch. Mr. Lanz agreed, and stating that he will attempt to incorporate that design element regardless of the design chosen. LeMenager asked the Historical Commission members to identify the acceptable aspects of the presented designs, in order to give Mr. Lanz an idea of how to move forward. Discussion regarding Demolition Permit Delay procedures and details.

Clemson stated that he is not in favor of waiving the demolition permit delay in this case, as this neighborhood has a very distinct character, and the house to be demolished is a "medieval revival house." Though Mr. Clemson appreciates Mr. Lanz's efforts, he will not support the waiver, and instead remain in support of preservation.

Mr. Lanz stated that he has adequately addressed the Commission's concerns and is even willing to invest his time and funds to appease the Commission. He added that the alternative to coming to a resolution today will be undesirable for the Commission's wishes.

Adams liked the existing house, as it is a unique home significant to Winchester's history. She understands substantial repairs are needed but agrees with Clemson and will not vote in favor of waiving the demolition delay. She believes the demolition would ultimately cause a loss to the town, and therefore believes this house is worthy of preservation.

Mr. Lanz reiterated his argument that his desire to invest in a design acceptable to Commission currently but will implement the previously presented plan come spring at the expiration of the 12-month delay.

Discussion regarding procedure and next steps: LeMenager noted the next Commission meeting is not until the Tuesday after Labor Day. Mr. Lanz noted his preference to begin incorporating design elements before the winter months, Clemson stated that a *Memorandum of Approved Elements* may be offered to the commission for their approval.

Mr. Lanz stated that he is happy to come back to another meeting but asks for guidance on whether the Commission will produce a favorable vote. LeMenager opined that he would like to see a design more aligned with the bottom sketch featuring the wrap-around porch, and that the top sketch mirrors many of Winchester's newer house models and would be inappropriate for the existing historical built environment.

Diab Jerius, Winchester Planning Board member in the audience, noted the difficulty for Historical Commission to move forward if they lack concrete voting material. Discussion regarding the level of detail needed in a drawing that Historical Commission will vote on.

Mr. Lanz invited members to visit the house, and agrees to allow Mr. Clemson to take interior photographs. Mr. Lanz will provide LeMenager with available dates/times, at which point a visit will be coordinated.

Mr. Lanz asked about contacting Historical Commission members absent from tonight's meeting, with Mr. Szekely, Winchester Town Planner, explained that all issues surrounding open applications are to be discussed in an open meeting, as communication outside meetings violate the Massachusetts Open Meeting Law.

Commission members identified aspects of the submitted design they approve: carriage style garage doors, returns, gable, and wrap-around porch.

### **Board of Appeals Petitions:**

- 1 Winter St. - follow-up discussion with petitioner

Chris Downey was present to appeal the Commission's recommendation of April 8, 2019 regarding his Special Permit. Mr. Downey stated he was not informed of the previous meeting. The Historical Commission previously decided that the addition would overwhelm the nature and historical character of the house.

Discussion regarding deeming the house *historically significant*. Mr. Downey referred to his research, specifically a 1970 decision. Mr. Clemson clarified that the information provided by the Winchester Archivist included inaccurate language.

Mr. Downey stated that he did not understand how this house falls into category of historically significant. Discussion regarding geographic/neighborhood/cultural components in addition to the building's physical attributes. Clemson reviewed zoning procedure as well as criteria for defining historical significance: embodying specific type, period, or method of construction. He further notes that the geographic area is distinct, as the house may have been associated with events which made substantial contributions to Winchester's history.

Mr. Downey argued that the house lacks historical significance and provided photographs to demonstrate the neighborhood's deteriorating state. He opined that the house is not historically or culturally significant, and that since by-laws do not specifically mention age of the home as a criterium, the house should not be defined as historically significant.

Discussion ensued regarding detailed components of architectural plan, defining historical/cultural significance, the national register, and the Historical Commission's responsibility to preserve the character of Winchester.

Mr. Downey again inquired as to the reasons his house has fit within the definition of historically significant, with members pointing out that this has been discussed and answered numerous times.

- 37 Kenwin Road - special permit, revised proposal

Szekely provided a summary of this case: it would appear that a garage is being demolished, as there are newer materials outside the home. In a response to Szekely's email, the owners clarified that they are not demolishing the garage, that the initial plans were to build an addition to the garage, but current plans are to enlarge the garage and attach it to the back of the house. Due to a lack of information, there was no previous motion made on this case.

**MOTION: That the Historical Commission table discussion on this matter until more information is obtained. Motion was made and seconded.**

**VOTED: 4 in favor, 0 opposed, 3 absent (Hickey, Boswell, Dowling)**

**MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.**

- 46 Allen Road - Special permit to construct an addition closer to side property line than permitted  
Jennifer & Clint Sard were present their case for a special permit allowing an addition closer to the side property line. This is a 1930 colonial home with garage and sun room. This portion of the house is original, all built together in 1930. Mr. and Ms. Sard stated their desire to add a floor with master bedroom, bathroom, and walk-in closet, and the current proposal reflects this floor aligning with the existing structure. They further explain that their contractor has sourced siding to match the original, and the addition will therefore maintain the same structural and aesthetic elements of the original home.

Szekely notes that the Winchester Planning Board reviewed this case and produced a favorable vote.

LeMenager and Mr. Clemson indicated their support of the design, pointing out desirable design aspects.

**MOTION: That the Historical Commission finds no adverse effect on historic resources in this matter. Motion was made and seconded.**

**VOTED: 4 in favor, 0 opposed, 3 absent (Hickey, Boswell, Dowling)**

**MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.**

- 37 Kenwin Road - Special permit to construct an addition closer to side property line than permitted

The Zoning Board has acted on this matter. Historical Commission will take no action at this point.

#### **Approve Minutes for July 8, 2019 meeting**

Discussion regarding 07/08/2019 minutes. The last paragraph under “Demolition Permit Follow Up - 4 Ardley Place,” on page 1, reflects the incorrect date of August 8. This should accurately read August 5.

**MOTION: That the Historical Commission approve the minutes of July 8, 2019 as presented and amended. Motion by Jennifer Adams and seconded by John Clemson.**

**VOTED: 4 in favor, 0 opposed, 3 absent (Hickey, Boswell, Dowling)**

**MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.**

#### **Other matters:**

Detailed discussion regarding the definition of “substantial” demolition, and impacts the definition has on the Commission’s work. Mr. Jerius joined the table to participate in the discussion of demolition versus interference with homeowners maintaining their homes. Further discussion regarding what constitutes demolition, e.g. windows.

Commission discussed possible development of a matrix and guidelines for demolition qualifying projects. Clemson volunteered to work on revising the language already structured in the document.

Discussion surrounding further details of restricting waivers, specifically with regards to 4 Ardley Place.

**Next meeting:**

The next Historical Commission meeting will be held on September 3, 2019 (Tuesday) in a location TBD.

**Adjourn:**

**MOTION: That the Historical Commission adjourn the 08/05/2019 meeting at 9:26 pm. Motion by Jennifer Adams; seconded by Jon Carlisle.**

**VOTED: 4 in favor, 0 opposed, 3 absent (Hickey, Boswell, Dowling)**

**MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.**

*Respectfully submitted August 12, 2019 by Mahala Lettvin, Recording Secretary*

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'J. LeMenager', with a large, sweeping flourish extending to the right.

Jack LeMenager, Chairman

September 4, 2019